

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA**

<b>STATE OF OKLAHOMA,</b>	)	
	)	
<b>Plaintiff,</b>	)	
	)	
<b>v.</b>	)	<b>No. 05-CV-329-GKF(SAJ)</b>
	)	
<b>TYSON FOODS, INC., et al.,</b>	)	
	)	
<b>Defendants.</b>	)	

**MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF DEFENDANTS' EXPERT  
WITNESSES DRs. SULLIVAN, MYODA, AND SAMADPOUR**

Plaintiff, the State of Oklahoma, ex rel. W.A. Drew Edmondson, in his capacity as Attorney General of the State of Oklahoma and Oklahoma Secretary of the Environment C. Miles Tolbert, in his capacity as the Trustee for Natural Resources for the State of Oklahoma ("the State"), and respectfully requests that this Court issue an order excluding the testimony of Defendants' experts Drs. Sullivan, Myoda, and Samadpour because their affidavits were produced to the State well after the Court's February 8, 2008 deadline.

1. District courts have the inherent power to enforce their own orders. *Roadway Express, Inc. v. Piper*, 447 U.S. 752, 764 (1980). This includes, of course, the ability to exclude untimely expert opinions. *O2 Micro Intern. Ltd. v. Monolithic Power Systems, Inc.*, 467 F.3d 1355, 1368-69 (Fed. Cir. 2006).

2. This Court ordered Defendants to produce all of their experts' opinions by Friday, February 8, 2008. (DKT # 1502, pg. 2, "the Court finds Defendants shall produce, by February 8, 2008, all expert opinions...")

3. On February 8, Defendants attempted to produce their expert materials to the State by sending separate emails from Defense Counsel John Elrod to State's Counsel Rick

Garren. This information included expert affidavits, CVs, and lists of publications, among other expert materials. Mr. Garren received affidavits from fifteen experts. Defense counsel did not produce hard copies of these affidavits to the State or produce to the State CDs containing the expert materials in electronic format. Neither Mr. Elrod nor any other counsel representing any Defendant called Mr. Garren to confirm that he had received all of the affidavits that Defendants intended Mr. Garren to receive. Nor did they send a complete list of the experts so that the State could inventory Defendants' disclosures to ensure it had a complete set.

4. On February 12 -- four days after the Court-imposed deadline -- at approximately 6 p.m., Defense counsel emailed the State affidavits for three additional experts, Drs. Sullivan, Myoda, and Samadpour, none of which were included in the February 8 expert disclosure.

5. Defendants' counsel claimed that these expert affidavits were produced on Friday, February 8, but they were not. The plain fact is that the State did not receive these expert affidavits until four days after the Court's deadline, thereby prejudicing the State in its preparations for the preliminary injunction hearing.

6. Defense Counsel's method of production was entirely irresponsible. These expert materials form the basis of Defendants' defense in this motion. But instead of actually ensuring that the State received the relevant information, Defense counsel simply emailed the materials to one of the State's attorneys (instead of emailing the material to all of the State's attorneys, as they have done in the past). Defense counsel never checked to ensure that State's counsel received all of Defendants expert materials, despite apparently being aware that one or more of their earlier e-mails of expert materials to defense counsel had encountered transmission problems. If they would have checked, they would have discovered that Mr. Garren never received information concerning three experts -- Drs. Sullivan, Myoda, and Samadpour

7. Because these three expert affidavits were not produced to the State by the Court-imposed deadline, the Court should enforce its order and exclude the testimony of these three experts.

WHEREFORE, for these reasons, therefore, the testimony of Drs. Sullivan, Myoda, and Samadpour should be excluded.

Respectfully Submitted,

W.A. Drew Edmondson OBA # 2628  
ATTORNEY GENERAL  
Kelly H. Burch OBA #17067  
J. Trevor Hammons OBA #20234  
Tina Lynn Izadi OBA #17978  
Daniel P. Lennington OBA #21577  
ASSISTANT ATTORNEYS GENERAL  
State of Oklahoma  
313 N.E. 21<sup>st</sup> St.  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
(405) 521-3921

/s/ M. David Riggs

M. David Riggs OBA #7583  
Joseph P. Lennart OBA #5371  
Richard T. Garren OBA #3253  
Douglas A. Wilson OBA #13128  
Sharon K. Weaver OBA #19010  
Robert A. Nance OBA #6581  
D. Sharon Gentry OBA #15641  
David P. Page OBA #6852  
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN,  
ORBISON & LEWIS  
502 West Sixth Street  
Tulsa, OK 74119  
(918) 587-3161

Louis Werner Bullock OBA #1305  
BULLOCK, BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE  
110 West Seventh Street Suite 110  
Tulsa OK 74119  
(918) 584-2001

James Randall Miller OBA #6214  
222 S. Kenosha  
Tulsa, Ok 74120-2421  
(918) 743-4460

Frederick C. Baker  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Lee M. Heath  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Elizabeth C. Ward  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Elizabeth Claire Xidis  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
28 Bridgeside Boulevard  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
(843) 216-9280

William H. Narwold  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Ingrid L. Moll  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
20 Church Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Hartford, CT 06103  
(860) 882-1676

Jonathan D. Orent  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Michael G. Rousseau  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick  
(admitted *pro hac vice*)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
321 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02940  
(401) 457-7700

Attorneys for the State of Oklahoma

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 18<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2008, I electronically transmitted the above and foregoing pleading to the Clerk of the Court using the ECF System for filing and a transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

W. A. Drew Edmondson, Attorney General  
Kelly H. Burch, Assistant Attorney General  
J. Trevor Hammons, Assistant Attorney General  
Tina Lynn Izadi, Assistant Attorney General  
Daniel P. Lennington, Assistant Attorney General

Fc\_docket@oag.state.ok.us  
kelly\_burch@oag.state.ok.us  
trevor\_hammons@oag.state.ok.us  
tina\_izadi@oag.state.ok.us  
daniel.lennington@oag.ok.gov

M. David Riggs  
Joseph P. Lennart  
Richard T. Garren  
Douglas A. Wilson  
Sharon K. Weaver  
Robert A. Nance  
D. Sharon Gentry  
David P. Page  
RIGGS, ABNEY, NEAL, TURPEN, ORBISON & LEWIS

driggs@riggsabney.com  
jlennart@riggsabney.com  
rgarren@riggsabney.com  
doug\_wilson@riggsabney.com  
sweaver@riggsabney.com  
rnance@riggsabney.com  
sgentry@riggsabney.com  
dpage@edbelllaw.com

Louis Werner Bullock  
BULLOCK, BULLOCK & BLAKEMORE

lbullock@bullock-blakemore.com

James Randall Miller

rmiller@mkblaw.net

Frederick C. Baker  
Lee M. Heath  
Elizabeth C. Ward  
Elizabeth Claire Xidis  
William H. Narwold  
Ingrid L. Moll  
Jonathan D. Orent  
Michael G. Rousseau  
Fidelma L. Fitzpatrick  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC

fbaker@motleyrice.com  
lheath@motleyrice.com  
lward@motleyrice.com  
cxidis@motleyrice.com  
bnarwold@motleyrice.com  
imoll@motleyrice.com  
jorent@motleyrice.com  
mrousseau@motleyrice.com  
ffitzpatrick@motleyrice.com

**Counsel for State of Oklahoma**

Robert P. Redemann  
Lawrence W. Zeringue  
David C. Senger

rredemann@pmrlaw.net  
lzingue@pmrlaw.net  
dsenger@pmrlaw.net

PERRINE, MCGIVERN, REDEMANN, REID, BARRY & TAYLOR, P.L.L.C.

Robert E Sanders  
Edwin Stephen Williams  
YOUNG WILLIAMS P.A.

rsanders@youngwilliams.com  
steve.williams@youngwilliams.com

**Counsel for Cal-Maine Farms, Inc and Cal-Maine Foods, Inc.**

John H. Tucker  
Theresa Noble Hill

jtucker@rhodesokla.com  
thill@rhodesokla.com

Colin Hampton Tucker ctucker@rhodesokla.com  
Leslie Jane Southerland ljsoutherland@rhodesokla.com  
RHODES, HIERONYMUS, JONES, TUCKER & GABLE

Terry Wayen West terry@thewestlawfirm.com  
THE WEST LAW FIRM

Delmar R. Ehrich dehrich@faegre.com  
Bruce Jones bjones@faegre.com  
Dara D. Mann dmann@faegre.com  
Krisann C. Kleibacker Lee kkleee@faegre.com  
Todd P. Walker twalker@faegre.com  
FAEGRE & BENSON, LLP

**Counsel for Cargill, Inc. & Cargill Turkey Production, LLC**

James Martin Graves jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com  
Gary V Weeks gweeks@bassettlawfirm.com  
Paul E. Thompson, Jr pthompson@bassettlawfirm.com  
Woody Bassett wbassett@bassettlawfirm.com  
Jennifer E. Lloyd jlloyd@bassettlawfirm.com  
BASSETT LAW FIRM

George W. Owens gwo@owenslawfirmmpc.com  
Randall E. Rose rer@owenslawfirmmpc.com  
OWENS LAW FIRM, P.C.

**Counsel for George's Inc. & George's Farms, Inc.**

A. Scott McDaniel smcdaniel@mhla-law.com  
Nicole Longwell nlongwell@mhla-law.com  
Philip Hixon phixon@mhla-law.com  
Craig A. Merkes cmerkes@mhla-law.com  
MCDANIEL, HIXON, LONGWELL & ACORD, PLLC

Sherry P. Bartley sbartley@mwsgw.com  
MITCHELL, WILLIAMS, SELIG, GATES & WOODYARD, PLLC

**Counsel for Peterson Farms, Inc.**

John Elrod jelrod@cwlaw.com  
Vicki Bronson vbronson@cwlaw.com  
P. Joshua Wisley jwisley@cwlaw.com  
Bruce W. Freeman bfreeman@cwlaw.com  
D. Richard Funk rfunk@cwlaw.com  
CONNER & WINTERS, LLP

**Counsel for Simmons Foods, Inc.**

Stephen L. Jantzen  
Paula M. Buchwald  
Patrick M. Ryan  
RYAN, WHALEY, COLDIRON & SHANDY, P.C.

[sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com](mailto:sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com)  
[pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com](mailto:pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com)  
[pryan@ryanwhaley.com](mailto:pryan@ryanwhaley.com)

Mark D. Hopson  
Jay Thomas Jorgensen  
Timothy K. Webster  
Thomas C. Green  
SIDLEY, AUSTIN, BROWN & WOOD LLP

[mhopson@sidley.com](mailto:mhopson@sidley.com)  
[jjorgensen@sidley.com](mailto:jjorgensen@sidley.com)  
[twebster@sidley.com](mailto:twebster@sidley.com)  
[tcgreen@sidley.com](mailto:tcgreen@sidley.com)

Robert W. George  
Michael R. Bond  
Erin W. Thompson  
KUTAK ROCK, LLP

[robert.george@kutakrock.com](mailto:robert.george@kutakrock.com)  
[michael.bond@kutakrock.com](mailto:michael.bond@kutakrock.com)  
[erin.thompson@kutakrock.com](mailto:erin.thompson@kutakrock.com)

**Counsel for Tyson Foods, Inc., Tyson Poultry, Inc., Tyson Chicken, Inc., & Cobb-Vantress, Inc.**

R. Thomas Lay  
KERR, IRVINE, RHODES & ABLES

[rtl@kiralaw.com](mailto:rtl@kiralaw.com)

Jennifer Stockton Griffin  
David Gregory Brown  
LATHROP & GAGE LC

[jgriffin@lathropgage.com](mailto:jgriffin@lathropgage.com)

**Counsel for Willow Brook Foods, Inc.**

Robin S Conrad  
NATIONAL CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER

[rconrad@uschamber.com](mailto:rconrad@uschamber.com)

Gary S Chilton  
HOLLADAY, CHILTON AND DEGIUSTI, PLLC

[gchilton@hcdattorneys.com](mailto:gchilton@hcdattorneys.com)

**Counsel for US Chamber of Commerce and American Tort Reform Association**

D. Kenyon Williams, Jr.  
Michael D. Graves  
Hall, Estill, Hardwick, Gable, Golden & Nelson

[kwilliams@hallestill.com](mailto:kwilliams@hallestill.com)  
[mgraves@hallestill.com](mailto:mgraves@hallestill.com)

**Counsel for Poultry Growers/Interested Parties/ Poultry Partners, Inc.**

Richard Ford  
LeAnne Burnett  
Crowe & Dunlevy

[richard.ford@crowedunlevy.com](mailto:richard.ford@crowedunlevy.com)  
[leanne.burnett@crowedunlevy.com](mailto:leanne.burnett@crowedunlevy.com)

**Counsel for Oklahoma Farm Bureau, Inc.**

Kendra Akin Jones, Assistant Attorney General  
Charles L. Moulton, Sr Assistant Attorney General

[Kendra.Jones@arkansasag.gov](mailto:Kendra.Jones@arkansasag.gov)  
[Charles.Moulton@arkansasag.gov](mailto:Charles.Moulton@arkansasag.gov)

Jessica E. Rainey  
Barry G. Reynolds  
TITUS HILLIS REYNOLD LOVE  
DICKMAN & McCALMON

[jrainey@titushillis.com](mailto:jrainey@titushillis.com)  
[reynolds@titushillis.com](mailto:reynolds@titushillis.com)

William S. Cox, III  
Nikaa Baugh Jordan  
LIGHTFOOT, FRANLIN & WHITE

[wcox@lightfootlaw.com](mailto:wcox@lightfootlaw.com)  
[njordan@lightfootlaw.com](mailto:njordan@lightfootlaw.com)

**Counsel for American Farm Bureau Federation and the National Cattlemen's Beef Association**

John D. Russell  
FELLERS, SNIDERS, BLAKENSHIP,  
BAILEY & TIPPENS, P.C.

[jrussell@fellerssnider.com](mailto:jrussell@fellerssnider.com)

**Counsel for Amicus Curiae Arkansas Farm Bureau Federation**

Mia Vahlberg  
GABLE GOTWALS

[mvahlberg@gablelaw.com](mailto:mvahlberg@gablelaw.com)

Adam J. Siegel  
James T. Banks  
HOGAN & HARTSON, LLP

[ajsiegel@hhlaw.com](mailto:ajsiegel@hhlaw.com)  
[jtbanks@hhlaw.com](mailto:jtbanks@hhlaw.com)

**Counsel for National Chicken Counsel, U.S. Poultry & Egg Association and National Turkey Federation (collectively "Amici Curiae")**

Also on this 18<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2008, I mailed a copy of the above and foregoing pleading to the following:

**David Gregory Brown**  
Lathrop & Gage, LC  
314 E. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65101

**Thomas C. Green**  
Sidley Austin Brown & Wood, LLP  
1501 K St. NW  
Washington, DC 20005

**Cary Silverman**  
**Victor E. Schwartz**  
Shook Hardy & Bacon LLP  
600 14<sup>th</sup> St. NW, Ste. 800  
Washington, DC 20005-2004



**C. Miles Tolbert**  
Secretary of the Environment  
State of Oklahoma  
3800 North Classen  
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

**Gary V. Weeks**  
Bassett Law Firm  
P.O. Box 3618  
Fayetteville, AR 72702

**Dustin McDaniel**  
**Justin Allen**  
Office of the Attorney General (Little Rock)  
323 Center Street, Suite 200  
Little Rock, AR 72201-2610

/s/ M. David Riggs  
M. David Riggs